Ethical Insights & Lessons Learned during a Sustained Hospital Initiative

Barbara Russell, Ph.D. (Phil) M.B.A.
Bioethicist/Assistant Professor
University Health Network, U of T’s Institute of Health Policy, Management & Evaluation, U of T’s Joint Centre for Bioethics

5th annual Ontario Shores Thought Leadership Forum
September 19, 2013
Objectives

1. Three consolidations of ethics-related insights and lessons learned over 4 years

2. Present different ethical ‘frames’/concepts to help reveal and examine restraint and seclusion use in healthcare

3. Two group activities to energize and share your own ethics-related knowledge and skills
1. This is Real

www.youtube.com/watch?v=7vYIS2tfQ3Q
Nora Jacobson’s Research on Dignity

human dignity: dignity-of-human nature

social dignity: dignity-of-self

and

dignity-in-relation
Your Group Work

Using the flip chart paper at your table, list real examples of:

(1) dignity promoting actions, behaviours, responses, communications

(2) dignity eroding actions, behaviours, responses, communications

when seclusion or physical / mechanical / environment restraints were used against the person’s will
Dignity eroders: rudeness, indifference, condescension, dismissal, diminishment, disregard, contempt, dependence, intrusion, objectification, restriction, trickery, grouping, labeling, vilification, suspicion, discrimination, exploitation, exclusion, revulsion, deprivation, bullying, assault, abjection

Dignity promoters:
dignity-of-self: contribution, accomplishment, independence, authenticity, discipline, creativity, enrichment, transcendence, control, restraint, perseverance, avoidance, resistance, preparation, concealment

dignity-in-relation: recognition, acceptance, presence, leveling, advocacy, empowerment, courtesy, love

Jacobson, 2009
Dignity eroders: rudeness, indifference, condescension, dismissal, diminishment, disregard, contempt, dependence, intrusion, objectification, restriction, trickery, grouping, labeling, vilification, suspicion, discrimination, exploitation, exclusion, revulsion, deprivation, bullying, assault, abjection

Dignity promoters:

dignity-of-self: contribution, accomplishment, independence, authenticity, discipline, creativity, enrichment, transcendence, control, restraint, perseverance, avoidance, resistance, preparation, concealment

dignity-in-relation: recognition, acceptance, presence, leveling, advocacy, empowerment, courtesy, love
Discipline = “performing routine activities like cleaning and exercising that are seen as responsible and ‘normal’”

Restraint = “demonstrating emotional or behavioral reserve”

Avoidance = “steering clear of [people] or activities that have in the past led to dignity [erosion]”

Resistance = “asserting oneself in the face of threats to dignity”

Concealment = “‘covering up’ embarrassing markers or situations”

Jacobson 2009, 6
2. Restraints & Seclusion: an Ethical “Crucible”
a) safety versus therapeutic

- responses to characterizing use as professional, therapeutic, unit failure

- responses to interventional “creep”

- intervening to prevent/stop client from harming himself
  “co-clients”
  “me”
b) sorting out who has to or for what?

patients/clients

rights

duties

responsibilities

healthcare staff

the healthcare organization

accountabilities
3. Margaret Walker’s Work on Moral Repair

Moral repair:

the task of restoring or stabilizing… and in some cases, creating… the basic elements that sustain human beings in a recognizably moral relationship…

governed by a particular scale of values, set of imperatives, or system of rule bound [moral] obligations” (23; italics added)

Walker’s work focuses on people causing serious harm or wrongdoing
3. Margaret Walker’s Work on Moral Repair

How to morally stabilize or restore relationships:

- first, take responsibility for causing the harm or the wrong

- make amends (or “setting things right”)
  - by figuring out what, at a minimum, it will take to stabilize,
    and more importantly, to restore the relationship
With colleagues at your table, discuss “making amends”:

- with an example of your own work in figuring out what you needed to do
- how challenging this was
- what you did do
- how it worked out in terms of stabilizing/restoring the relationship
Stephen Carter’s Work on Integrity

Step 1. “discerning [your] deepest understanding of right and wrong”

Step 2. acting openly and “consistently with what [you’ve] learned,”
sometimes at risk to [your] own self-interests/welfare

Step 3. “be willing to say that [you’re] acting consistently with what
[you’ve] decided is right”

Carter 1997, 10-11
Concluding Points

1. Regarding restraint/seclusion prevention, reduction, and use, how do we intentionally promote dignity? What do we intentionally do to avoid ‘dignity erosion’?

2. Examination and discussion about “crucible-like” healthcare practices become ethically framed when they’re a shared inquiry, open, patient, and strive to understand this reality for all those involved/affected from their experiences and views.

3. It’s useful to clarify and distinguish rights, duties, responsibilities and accountabilities and who “has” them and ‘to whom” are they owed.

4. Moral repair is “heavy,” but necessary work, individually and collectively.
References


Feeling Trapped and Being Torn: physicians’ narratives about ethical dilemmas in hemodialysis care that evoke a troubled conscience (2011). Grönlund, Dahlqvist & Söderberg, *BMC Medical Ethics* 12(8): online.
  *Perspectives in Psychiatric Care* 46(3): 221-33.


Thank you

Questions?
Challenges?
Insights to Share?

barbara.russell@uhn.ca
barbara.russell@utoronto.ca